Evaluating the Impacts Of Healthy Food Financing Initiatives

Roundtable Participants

Donna Leuchten Nuccio, Reinvestment Fund

Candace Young, The Food Trust

Olivia Rebanal, Capital Impact Partners

Ceyl Prinster, Colorado Enterprise Fund

Moderator: Caroline Harries, The Food Trust

#OFNCONF #RETHINK
The Food Trust

Ensuring that everyone has access to affordable, nutritious food and information to make healthy decisions.

Healthy Food Financing

2004

#OFNCONF #RETHINK
Food Access Research

- Accessing healthy food is a challenge for many Americans – particularly in low-income neighborhoods, communities of color, and rural areas.
- Better access corresponds with healthier eating
- Access is associated with lower risk for obesity and other diet-related diseases.
- Healthy food retail creates jobs and helps to revitalize low-income neighborhoods.

Available at: [http://thefoodtrust.org/food-access/publications](http://thefoodtrust.org/food-access/publications)

Donna Leuchten Nuccio, Reinvestment Fund
PA Fresh Food Financing Initiative

A public/partnership to increase access to fresh foods in underserved communities across Pennsylvania.

Program Objectives*:

- Reduce the high incidence of diet-related diseases by providing healthy food;
- Stimulate investment of private capital in low wealth communities;
- Remove financial obstacles and lower operating barriers for supermarkets in poor communities;
- Create living wage jobs; and
- Prepare and retain a qualified workforce.

* As defined at program origination
**Portfolio Characteristics**

- Majority of operators participating in FFFI own more than one store
- Store size range from 900 to 70,000 sq. ft
- 1/3 of the projects financed are located in Philadelphia and 2/3 are in small cities, towns and rural areas
- Financed construction of new stores, equipment purchases and acquisition of existing stores

**Distribution of Stores by Size (square feet) and Geographic Category**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Geographic Category</th>
<th>50,000 or less</th>
<th>50,001 to 25,000</th>
<th>25,001 to 49,999</th>
<th>More than 40,000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>25.0%</td>
<td>61.20%</td>
<td>12.50%</td>
<td>0.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>30.00%</td>
<td>20.00%</td>
<td>20.00%</td>
<td>30.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>28.00%</td>
<td>25.00%</td>
<td>17.80%</td>
<td>28.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mix of Approved Projects**

- Existing - Equipment purchase: 6%
- Existing - Major Expansion: 10%
- Existing - Rehab/Refit expansion: 4%
- Funds did not result in store opening: 2%
- New Construction - Site never had a store: 24%
- New Construction - Site used to have store but closed: 17%

**PA FFFI Metrics**

- 206 applications received
- 88 projects funded
- $11.9 MM grants approved
- $73.2 MM loans closed
- $194 MM total project costs
- 5,023 jobs created/retained
- 1.6 MM square feet developed

As reported 6/2010
Econsult Study Highlights

1. **Improved Real Estate:** Supermarket development could improve the overall attractiveness of a community, helping to attract or retain more residents in the area. In turn, those residents would attract other retail business into the community.

2. **New Investment:** Supermarket investment could increase economic activity in the community and surrounding region, increase the number of and quality of jobs and generate additional tax revenue for state and local governments.

3. **Lower Prices:** Supermarkets could potentially improve access to higher-quality food products at lower costs to the consumer.
NJFAI Goals and Objectives

- Attract and retain quality, healthy food retailers;
- Stimulate economic development and local job creation;
- Encourage innovation in healthy food retailing and distribution; and
- Improve access to affordable, fresh food as a pathway to better health outcomes.

NJFAI Metrics

- 62 applications received
- 22 projects funded
- $1 MM grants approved
- $750 MM grant financed loans
- $23.4 MM loans closed
- $159 MM leveraged
- 1,712 jobs created/retained
- 1,118 construction jobs

As of 10/12/17
Evaluating Impact of Healthy Food Financing Initiatives

Candace Young, The Food Trust, Philadelphia, PA

Evaluation of Healthy Food Financing:

- Strategy
- Key Results (NJFAI)
- Future Directions
HFFI Evaluation Goals

1) Community health and diet quality
2) Community food access and perceptions
3) Economic development, local job creation
**Evaluation Strategy & Design**

- Broad scope: fresh food availability and affordability across multiple funded sites
- In-depth focus in select underserved communities
- Camden: renovated store
  Newark: new construction
- Customer survey 3-mos after store opening
  (Camden n=199; Newark n=201; Total n=400)

---

**“Has this store improved the community?”**

- Yes: 97.9%
- No: 2.1%
“Does this store encourage you to buy healthier foods and/or beverages?”

- Yes: 77.9%
- No: 22.1%

“Since you began shopping at this store, have you changed what foods and beverages you buy for you or your family?”

- Yes: 41.2%
- No: 58.8%
“If YES, what has changed regarding the following foods and beverages?”

"It's a meeting place for people who haven't seen each other in a while, everybody coming to the grocery store ... This a meetin' room!... It's a meeting room and that's beautiful. 75% of Camden, this is the spot - my neighbors, my girlfriend on the phone, my nurse and her children. I get up on the phone and I tell my girlfriend to go over to the Price-Rite because they got reasonable prices. That's how we talk."
Immediate Outcomes

1. Jobs for community members
2. Increased access to healthy food in the community
3. Stores are a community gathering place and reach long-time residents
4. Improvements in perceptions of the community, food access, neighborhood satisfaction and healthy food purchases
5. Increased healthy food purchases – more fruits, vegetables, whole grains

Future Directions

1. Supermarkets are the foundation for healthy food availability in low-income communities
2. Research how healthy food retail access improves community perceptions, f/v consumption, effectiveness of other health interventions
3. Determine phases and levels of impact; realistic short- and long-term goals for impact
4. Sustain HFFI impact with in-store marketing, community outreach and education (e.g., pricing incentives/coupons, Food Bucks in supermarkets, store tours, taste tests, nutrition education)
Health Impact Pyramid


Food Access Impact Pyramid

#OFNCONF #RETHINK
Thank you!

Candace Young
Associate Director
Research & Evaluation
The Food Trust
cyoung@thefoodtrust.org

Olivia Rebanal, Director, Loan Programs
Capital Impact Partners
2016 OPPORTUNITY FINANCE NETWORK CONFERENCE

Delivering Social Impact Nationwide

Healthy Food Financing Programs

$112M+ in loans and grants deployed
76 new grocery stores
1M people with fresh food access
Food Systems Program Evaluation: Ways we have been involved

1. Participant in Independent Research
2. Lead on Assessment Work
3. Collector of Social Impact Metrics

Independent Research: California FreshWorks Fund Study

- Capital Impact Partners was Fund Administrator 2011-2015
- Independent Team included:
  - Sarah Samuels Center for Public Health Research & Evaluation
  - InSight at Pacific Community Ventures
  - Funding from The California Endowment
Independent Research: California FreshWorks Fund Reports

- **Case Study** details development, implementation, challenges and lessons learned
- **Social and Economic Impact Report** details employment, job quality, and broader economic impact
- **Food Access Report** details availability of fresh food and customer perception

Independent Research: Michigan Good Food Fund

- Finalizing evaluation team
- Participating in interviews, study design development
- Incorporating any data into existing reporting
### Independent Research: Michigan Good Food Fund

- **#1** Retrospective Summary of Implementation of MGFF
- **#2** Changes in Healthy Food Access - Store Patrons Perceptions
- **#3** Changes in Healthy Food Access - Community Perceptions
- **#4** Assess Economic Opportunity Changes
- **#5** Changes in Consumption & Wellbeing of Underserved Communities
- **#6** The Fund’s Influence on Policy Makers & Organizations

### Internally-Led Assessment: California FreshWorks Fund Grant Portfolio

- Issued RFP
- Selected Center for Community Health and Evaluation, Group Health Research Institute
Internally-Led Assessment: California FreshWorks Fund Grant Portfolio

- Conducted site visits, interviews of staff and clients
- Completed three case studies of grantees, story format detailing community impact
- Conducted survey of 52 grantees that received $2.1 million

Making a difference

Community Services Unlimited draws support in South Central L.A.

- Leverage the FreshWorks Fund's ability to use FreshWorks grant funds to support the design, development, and implementation of innovative, education-related programs that have been found to address critical needs, particularly those related to workforce development and economic development for low-income communities.

APIOA delivers fresh produce to Asian and Pacific Islander communities

- Leverage the FreshWorks Fund to support projects that promote health and well-being, such as programs that provide fresh, healthy food options to communities with limited access to healthy food.

Kitchens for Good: Cooking up change in San Diego

- Leverage the FreshWorks Fund to support projects that promote economic development, such as programs that provide training and job opportunities to disadvantaged populations.

Project Reconnect creates hope and community for formerly incarcerated individuals. Following the completion of FreshWorks grant funding, Project Reconnect successfully expanded its programs and services, providing critical support to formerly incarcerated individuals and their families.
Internal Social Impact Measurement
Healthy Food Financing Programs

Sales:
- % from food assistance programs
- % from perishable goods
- Total revenue
- # educational facilities, # childcare centers,
  # health care centers served (for distributors)
Internal Social Impact Measurement
Healthy Food Financing Programs

Nutrition Education or Healthy Food Programming
- Sells local/regional food
- Sells prepared foods with menu labeling
- At least 1 junk-food-free aisle
- Does not sell cigarettes
- Sells organic product
- Employs Waste Management program
- Uses healthy product promotion

Jobs Information
- # of employees earning >livable wage
- # of employees earning between livable and median wage
- # of employees earning <median wage
- % employees with paid benefits
- # of employees aged 50+
Ceyl Prinster, President and CEO
Colorado Enterprise Fund

our story

- Largest Colorado-based CDFI - $26 million in assets
- Small business focus - loans up to $500,000
- Founded in 1976 – 40th Anniversary
- Certified as a CDFI since 1995
- Statewide service area – most loans are along Front Range; large geographic area

#OFNCONF  #RETHINK
our organization

- 21 FTE staff - all based in Colorado
- Loans sizes range from $1,000-$500,000
- Average loan size: $42,700
- 550 loans in portfolio

Staff includes
- Healthy Foods Program Manager
- Business advising available for free or low cost to all borrowers

healthy foods fund

Why food?
- economic development
- community health and well-being
- market gaps for capital
- national initiative to address food access disparities
- food is big in Colorado as part of economic system
**Purpose of Healthy Foods Fund at CEF:**
- ensure access to fresh, nutritious and affordable food
- foster a vibrant local food economy.

**Market for loans: all segments of the food system**
- food producers
- food distributors
- food packaging, processing and manufacturing
- retail grocery providers
- innovative food enterprises

---

**Funding**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HFFI</td>
<td>$1,550,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO4F</td>
<td>$750,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ReFresh</td>
<td>$400,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>$2,700,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Loans**

- 33 Loans
- $1,362,312
- 11 Retail Stores 28,632 sq.ft.
- 22 Other Food System
Impact Story
The Crunchy Grocer

First retail grocer financed under CEF’s Healthy Foods Fund program

A grocery store and community gathering place

healthy food hub

**Business Summary**

*Started:* 2014

*Type:* Grocery

*Loans:* $153,400

*Impact:* 18 employees

*Technical Assistance:* Business planning, accounting, marketing

Impact Story
Jumpin’ Good Goat Dairy

Rural food production, retail outlet, and product manufacturer

Sustainable farming, humane animal treatment, enhancing local food systems.

**Business Summary**

*Started:* 1997, Buena Vista CO

*Type:* Producer, retail and product

*Loans:* $36,000

*Impact:* 22 employees

*Technical Assistance:* Business planning, accounting, marketing
Roundtable Discussion

Donna Leuchten Nuccio, Reinvestment Fund
Candace Young, The Food Trust
Olivia Rebanal, Capital Impact Partners
Ceyl Prinster, Colorado Enterprise Fund
Moderator: Caroline Harries, The Food Trust
Q & A

Healthy Food Access Portal

www.healthyfoodaccess.org
Thank you!